Appendix for "Bridging the Gap between the Field and the Lab: Environmental Goods, Policy Maker Input, and Consequentiality" by C.A. Vossler and M.F. Evans.

A. Instructions

Introduction

Please pay careful attention to the instructions. As before, you will not be asked to reveal your identity to anyone during this experiment. Your name will not be associated with your decisions. Please consider again our simple yet very important rules:

- In order to keep your decisions private, please do not reveal your choices to any other participant.
- Do not communicate with anyone in the room except a coordinator.
- Please do not hesitate to ask questions. If you have a question, raise your hand and a coordinator will answer it.

The Proposal

<all but Hypothetical Referendum>

In this experiment you will be asked to vote in a referendum on whether everyone in the group will fund the purchase of an on-campus, classroom recycling container at a particular cost.

The recycling container has a 23-gallon capacity, is constructed in high impact molded plastic, and is manufactured by Rubbermaid. The blue container has a "We Recycle" imprint, and is for paper products. We will now pass out photographs of the container for you to view.

If purchased, the container will be placed in one of the large classrooms in the Humanities and Social Sciences (HSS) building. Arrangements have been made with the Facilities Services Department to administer the container at no additional charge. At present, there are two recycling containers located on each floor of HSS, generally at the extreme ends of the building. There are no recycling bins inside any classroom. The Facilities Services Department, which is responsible for the basic operation and maintenance of the physical facilities at UT, currently has no plan of its own to purchase and administer classroom recycling bins in HSS or any other building. Further, there are no opportunities for you and other students to directly purchase recycling containers for use in classrooms.

If the referendum passes, we will subtract a specified amount from your experiment earnings and set this cash aside. We will take your cash, write *this* check in the exact amount collected and the check will be mailed to Facilities Services. The check will be accompanied with *this* letter, which describes that the money is to be used for the purchase of the recycling container, as we described to you. We will put the check and letter in *this* stamped envelope addressed to Facilities Services. We will ask for one of you to volunteer to put the stamped envelope in the mail. As soon as we receive a receipt from Facilities Services, we will post it outside of the door of the Experimental Economics Laboratory for your inspection.

If the referendum does not pass, no money will be subtracted from your earnings. No check will be sent to Facilities Services and no recycling container will be placed in an HSS classroom.

<To help ensure that the proposal was credible, participants were given a copy of the letter that would accompany the check in the event the proposal was funded.>

<Hypothetical Referendum>

In this experiment you will be asked to vote in a referendum on whether everyone in the group will fund the provision of an on-campus, classroom recycling container at a particular cost. If the referendum passes, the funds collected from you and the other experiment participants will exactly cover the purchase of the recycling container and the costs associated with having the bin emptied on a regular basis.

If purchased, the container will be placed in one of the large classrooms in the Humanities and Social Sciences (HSS) building. At present, there are two large recycling containers located on each floor of HSS, generally at the extreme ends of the building. There are no recycling bins inside any classroom. The Facilities Services Department at UT, which is responsible for the basic operation of all on-campus buildings, currently has no plan of its own to purchase classroom recycling bins for HSS or any other building. Further, there are no opportunities for you and other students to directly provide recycling containers for use in classrooms.

The recycling container has a 23-gallon capacity, is constructed in high impact molded plastic, and is manufactured by Rubbermaid. The blue container has a "We Recycle" imprint, and is for mixed paper products including newspapers and printer paper. Arrangements have been made with the Facilities Services Department to empty the container on a regular basis. We will now pass out photographs of the container for you to view.

If the referendum passes, we will subtract a specified amount from your experiment earnings and set this cash aside. We will take this cash and write a check in the exact amount collected from the group. The check will be mailed to Facilities Services. We will ask for one of you to volunteer to put the stamped envelope containing the check in the mail immediately after this session. As soon as we receive a receipt from Facilities Services, we will post it outside of the door of the Experimental Economics Laboratory for your inspection. We will now pass out a letter from Facilities Services that verifies we have made the arrangements we described to you.

If the referendum does not pass, no money will be subtracted from your earnings. No check will be sent to Facilities Services and no recycling container will be placed in an HSS classroom.

The Decision Rule

<Baseline Referendum>

The referendum passes if a majority, or more than 50% of the total votes cast are YES votes. Otherwise, the referendum <u>does not pass</u>.

Before we proceed to the referendum, where you will be presented with a cost amount to consider, are there any questions?

<Implicit Advisory Referendum>

Passage of the referendum will not solely be determined by how you and the other participants vote. In particular, we, the experiment coordinators, will use your votes as *advice* on whether or not to pass the referendum. While you will not be told how we came to a decision, know that the likelihood the referendum is passed increases with the number of YES votes cast. Said another way, you increase the chance the referendum passes by casting a YES vote, and decrease the chance the referendum passes by casting a NO vote.

Before we proceed to the referendum, where you will be presented with a cost amount to consider, are there any questions?

<*Explicit-C Advisory Referendum*>

Passage of the referendum will not solely be determined by how you and the other participants vote. In particular, we, the experiment coordinators, will also cast votes. The number of experiment coordinator votes is equal to one-third the number of experiment participants. Since there are **12** participants, there will be **4** experiment coordinator votes. So, a total of **16** will be cast, with 25% of them cast by the experiment coordinators and 75% from experiment participants.

You will never be told how the experiment coordinators vote. All these may be YES votes, all these may be NO votes, or it may be any combination of YES and NO votes. Our votes were determined prior to the experiment, and do not depend in any way on how you and the other participants vote.

The referendum passes if a majority, or more than 50% of the total votes cast (including experimenter and participant votes) are YES votes. Otherwise, the referendum <u>does not pass</u>.

Before we proceed to the referendum, where you will be presented with a cost amount to consider, are there any questions?

<Explicit-UC Advisory Referendum>

Passage of the referendum will not solely be determined by how you and the other participants vote. In particular, we, the experiment coordinators, will also cast votes. The number of experiment coordinator votes is equal to three times the number of experiment participants. Since there are **12** participants, there will be **36** experiment coordinator votes. So, a total of **48** will be cast, with 75% of them cast by the experiment coordinators and 25% from experiment participants.

You will never be told how the experiment coordinators vote. All these may be YES votes, all these may be NO votes, or it may be any combination of YES and NO votes. Our votes were determined prior to the experiment, and do not depend in any way on how you and the other participants vote.

The referendum passes if a majority, or more than 50% of the total votes cast are YES votes. Otherwise, the referendum <u>does not pass</u>. Before we proceed to the referendum, are there any questions?

<Hypothetical Referendum>

The referendum passes if a majority, or more than 50% of the total votes cast are YES votes. Otherwise, the referendum <u>does not pass</u>.

Before we proceed to the referendum, where you will be presented with a *hypothetical* cost amount to consider, are there any questions?

B. <u>Questionnaire</u>

Please answer the following questions. This is for our information only. Your responses will only be associated with your subject identification number and will in no way affect your earnings.

Section A: About the Experiments

- 1. Have you previously participated in an economics experiment? (circle one) YES NO
- Did we sufficiently compensate you for your time and effort? Please indicate your answer below, on a scale of 1 ("insufficient") to 5 ("very sufficient"): (circle one) 1 2 3 4 5
- On a scale of 1 ("poorly understood") to 5 ("well understood"), please indicate how well you understood the instructions for Experiment 1 (lottery):
 (circle one) 1 2 3 4 5
- 4. On a scale of 1 ("poorly understood") to 5 ("well understood"), please indicate how well you understood the instructions for Experiment 2 (auction):
 (*circle one*) 1 2 3 4 5
- 5. On a scale of 1 ("poorly understood") to 5 ("well understood"), please indicate how well you understood the instructions for Experiment 3 (referendum):
 (circle one) 1 2 3 4 5
- 6. Please indicate whether you agree or disagree with the following statements related to the referendum.

| Existing recycling opportunities on campus are adequate. | AGREE | DISAGREE |
|--|-------|----------|
| I have classes and/or expect to have classes in HSS. | AGREE | DISAGREE |
| Funding the recycling container is well worth it to me. | AGREE | DISAGREE |
| There should be a recycling container in every classroom. | AGREE | DISAGREE |
| I did not have enough information to make a comfortable decision | | |
| in the referendum | AGREE | DISAGREE |
| I would like to see the recycling container funded, but I can | | |

not afford to pay for it

7. We would like to get a better indication of what you would have been willing to pay for the recycling container as described in our experiment referendum. Please consider the following possible payment amounts, and indicate the *highest* amount for which you would have voted YES for in the referendum: (*Please circle ONE response*)

| \$0 | \$1 | \$2 | \$3 | \$4 | \$5 | \$6 | \$7 | \$8 | \$9 | \$10 | > \$10 |
|------------|------------|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|-----|------------|------------|------|--------|
| - | • | | - | | | - | | - | | | |

<Explicit-C Advisory and Explicit-UC Advisory referenda only>

8. In the experiment referendum, some of the votes cast came from the experiment moderators. Before you cast your vote, what best describes your perception of the percentage of YES moderator votes?

0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 70% 80% 90% 100%

<Implicit Advisory, Explicit-C Advisory and Explicit-UC Advisory referenda only>

8/9. If passage of the referendum depended *only* on participant votes, would you have voted differently? (*circle one*) YES NO

<Hypothetical Referendum only>

8. Suppose instead of it being *hypothetical*, the experiment referendum were *real*. That is, if the majority of participants voted YES, money would actually be collected and the recycling container would be purchased, situated and maintained as described. Would you have voted differently? (*circle one*) YES NO

Section B: About You

- 1. What is your age? _____
- 2. What is your gender? (*circle one*) Male Female

3. What is your major? (*be specific*)

4. What is your classification for the Fall 2007 semester? (circle one)

| Freshman | Sophomore | Junior | Senior |
|------------------|-------------|------------------|--------|
| Master's Student | Law Student | Doctoral Student | |
| Other | _ | | |

5. What is your student status for the current semester? (circle one)

| Full-time student | Part-time student (taking fewer than 12 hours/sem) |
|-------------------|--|
| Not a student | Other (please specify): |

6. How many economics courses have you taken at the university level? (include this semester)

- 7. In your previous economics classes, have you studied the economics of public goods? (*circle one*) YES NO
- 8. Have you ever voted in a state or national election (either in the U.S. or in your home country)? (*circle one*) YES NO
- 9. Have you ever bought or sold items through an auction, such as eBay? YES NO
- 10. With which political party do you best identify with? (circle one)

| Democratic | Republican | Green Party |
|-------------|-------------|-------------------------|
| Independent | Libertarian | Other (please specify): |

11. How would you best describe your current employment situation? (*circle one*)

Full-time employment outside of the university Part-time employment outside of the university Student only Work at the university/research assistantship

12. Do you now, or have you ever, belonged to a group that promotes environmental causes? (*circle one*) YES NO

Please use the space below to write any comments you may have about the experiment.